

Joseph R. Brendel
Direct Dial 412 394 2373
Email: jbrendel@thorpreed.com



ATTORNEYS AT LAW SINCE 1895

VIA CERTIFIED MAIL RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

October 6, 2006

Sarah Flanagan, Esquire Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel U. S. Environmental Protection Agency 290 Broadway - 17th Floor New York, NY 10007-1866

Re: Diamond Alkali Superfund Site

Response to General Notice Letter to Chargeurs, Inc.

Dear Ms. Flanagan:

This is in response to the General Notice Letter, dated September 11, 2006, from Mr. Ray Basso, Strategic Integration Manager, Emergency and Remedial Response Division, of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), notifying Chargeurs, Inc. of its potential liability related to the Diamond Alkali Superfund Site (the "Site") and inviting Chargeurs, Inc. to become a "cooperating party" for the Lower Passaic River Restoration Project. For the reasons set forth herein, Chargeurs, Inc. denies that it has any liability with respect to the Site and, accordingly, respectfully declines the EPA's invitation to participate in the project. Furthermore, Chargeurs, Inc. requests that the EPA remove Chargeurs, Inc. from the list of potentially responsible parties ("PRPs") for the Site.

As a preliminary matter, I note that Mr. Basso's September 1, 2006 correspondence was addressed to "Chargeurs, 38, Rue Marbeuf, 75008 Paris, France." Chargeurs, Inc. is not located at that address in France, which instead is the address of Chargeurs, S.A., a French company. Chargeurs, S.A. has no connection whatsoever to any operations in New Jersey that may have led to the presence of hazardous substances in the Lower Passaic River. In fact, Chargeurs, S.A. does not conduct, and has never conducted, business of any kind in the State of New Jersey.

Furthermore, a copy of Mr. Basso's letter was sent to "Chargeurs Wool USA. Inc." ("Chargeurs Wool") with an address of 178 Wool Road, Jamestown, South Carolina 29453. Although that is the current registered address of Chargeurs, Inc., Chargeurs Wool and Chargeurs, Inc. are separate and distinct corporations. Like Chargeurs, S.A., Chargeurs Wool has no connection to any operations in New Jersey that may have led to the presence of hazardous substances in the Lower Passaic River. Accordingly, neither Chargeurs, S.A. nor Chargeurs Wool should be considered a PRP with respect to the Site.

I now turn to the alleged liability of Chargeurs, Inc. ("Chargeurs") at the Site. As indicated in Mr. Basso's September 11, 2006 correspondence, an entity known as United Piece Dye Works ("United") owned and operated several facilities in Lodi, New Jersey.

Pittsburah

Philadelphia

Princeton

Wheeling

Thorp Reed & Armstrong, LLP One Oxford Centre 301 Grant Street, 14th Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15219-1425 412 394 7711 412 394 2555 Fax



Sarah Flanagan, Esquire Page 2 October 6, 2006

However, in 1959, United ceased operations in Lodi and sold all or a substantial portion of its real estate to Bel Vista Trailer Park, Inc. In 1972 Prixilla, S.A., a Swiss company, acquired 21% of the stock of United. In 1997, Prixilla, S.A. changed its name to Colores Holding, S.A. In 1972 Fibag, a Swiss company, acquired 21% of the stock of United. Fibag later changed its name to Pricel, A.G. In 1977, Finco Limited, a Guernsey, Chanel Island company, acquired 48% of United. Finco Limited later changed its name to Pricel Limited. As a result of these transactions, by 1977, 90% of the stock of United was owned by three (3) different foreign companies, none of which owned a controlling interest in United.

On January 26, 1979, United was merged into UPDW, Inc. ("UPDW"), a Delaware Corporation incorporated on January 18, 1979. UPDW was 100% jointly owned by the same three foreign companies that owned the majority of the shares of United. At that time or shortly thereafter, all of the stock of UPDW, owned by Colores (Swiss), Pricel, A.G. (Swiss) and Pricel Limited (Guernsey), was contributed to Pricel, Inc, a Delaware corporation incorporated on December 29, 1978. On December 21,1982, Pricel, Inc. changed its name to "Chargeurs, Inc."

Therefore, Chargeurs, then known as "Pricel, Inc.," became the sole shareholder of UPDW approximately 20 years after United ceased its operations in Lodi, New Jersey. Given this time frame, it is clear that Chargeurs had absolutely no involvement in the day-to-day operations of United when the Lodi facilities were operating. Chargeurs could not have played any role in environmental matters at the United facilities and cannot be considered to be an "operator" under CERCLA. *United States v. Bestfoods*, 524 U.S. 51 (1998).

Furthermore, because United's Lodi, New Jersey operations ceased well before Chargeurs' acquisition of the stock of UPDW, there are no extraordinary circumstances warranting piercing of the corporate veil in order to hold Chargeurs liable for United's alleged liability at the Site. Accordingly, Chargeurs denies EPA's assertions that it is the "successor" to United and is potentially liable for response costs which may be incurred related to the Site. To the contrary, the relevant facts establish that Chargeurs is not the successor to United and that there is no basis for imputing any alleged liability of United to Chargeurs.

Finally, please note that UPDW was dissolved pursuant to the laws of the State of Delaware by filing a Certificate of Dissolution with the Delaware Secretary of State on January 25, 1983. A copy of UPDW's Certificate of Dissolution is attached hereto. The Delaware General Corporation Law provides that claims against a dissolved entity, or the shareholders of the dissolved entity, must be brought within three years of the dissolution. Therefore, any claim asserted against UPDW or Chargeurs would be barred by the Delaware General Corporation Law.



Sarah Flanagan, Esquire Page 3 October 6, 2006

In conclusion, Chargeurs is not responsible for any alleged liability of its former, dissolved subsidiary, UPDW, for activities that United conducted at the Site twenty (20) years prior to Chargeurs acquiring the stock of UPDW. Chargeurs also cannot otherwise be considered an "operator" under CERCLA for activities related to the Site. Therefore, Chargeurs should be removed from the list of PRPs for the Site.

If you have any questions with respect to this matter, please feel free to contact me.

Very truly yours. Joseph R.Brendel

Joseph R. Brendel

JRB/jmb Attachment

cc: William H. Hyatt, Esquire (w/attachment)

Philippe Haroche (w/attachment)

State of Delaware

Office of the Secretary of State PAGE 1

I, EDWARD J. FREEL, SECRETARY OF STATE OF THE STATE OF DELAWARE, DO HEREBY CERTIFY THE ATTACHED IS A TRUE AND CORRECT COPY OF THE CERTIFICATE OF DISSOLUTION OF "UPDW, INC.", FILED IN THIS OFFICE ON THE TWENTY-FIFTH DAY OF JANUARY, A.D. 1983, AT 10 O'CLOCK A.M.

Control of the second of the s

Edward J. Freel, Secretary of State

AUTHENTICATION:

DATE: 7855917

03-07-96

0866181 8100

960066517

10 An

FILED

CERTIFICATE OF DISSOLUTION

JAN 25 1983

OF

UPDW, INC.

MEan Chenton

Adopted in accordance with the provisions of Section 275 of the General Corporation Law of the State of Delaware

We, Eugene A. DeLutio, President, and Richard M. Kart, Secretary, of UPDW, Inc., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Delaware (the "Corporation"), do hereby certify as follows:

FIRST: That the Board of Directors of the Corporation, by the unanimous vote of the whole board, has adopted a resolution deeming it advisable that the Corporation be dissolved.

SECOND: That, in lieu of a meeting and vote of the stockholders of the Corporation, the dissolution of the Corporation has been duly adopted by the written consent of the sole stockholder of the Corporation, in accordance with the provisions of Section 228 of the General Corporation Law.

THIRD: That the dissolution of the Corporation was duly authorized in accordance with the provisions of Section 275 of the General Corporation Law.

FOURTH: That the names and addresses of the officers and directors of the Corporation are as follows:

Name	Office	Residence
Eugene A. DeLutio, Director and President	c/o Chargeurs Inc. 111 West 40th Street New York, NY 10018	3 Green Briar Lane Dix Hills, NY 11746
R. Douglas McPheters, Director and Assistant Secretary		106 East 85th Street New York, NY 10028
Richard M. Kart, Secretary Controller	c/o Chargeurs Inc. 111 West 40th Street New York, NY 10018	65 Keane Lane East Northport, Long Island 11731

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, we have signed this certificate this $27^{\rm rh}{\rm day}$ of December, 1982.

Jeeghe d'Algula Bugent A. DeLutio/President

ATTEST:

Richard M. Kart, Secretary